



**Tracking Completers from Touro's School Leadership Program
Working in the New York City Public Schools**

**Completers from 2017-18 and
Update on Completers from 2015-16 and 2016-17**

**Final Copy
September 11, 2019**

Contents

Overview and Purpose of the Study	4
Audience	5
Research Questions (RQ)	6
Methodology	6
Results	7
RQ 1. Description of the School Leadership Completers	7
RQ 2. Employment of Touro School Leadership Completers in NYCPS Prior to Program Completion	8
RQ 3. Change in NYCPS Employment Status of School Leadership Graduates on/after Program Completion	11
Summary and Conclusions	13

Tables

Table 1. Age distribution of Touro School Leadership program completers by year of completion	7
Table 2. Program majors of Touro School Leadership program completers by year of program completion	8
Table 3. Numbers and percentages of Touro Leadership program completers in each program major that were employed as teachers in the NYC Public Schools prior to program completion by year of completion	9
Table 4. Boroughs in which completers of Touro School Leadership program were first hired as teachers disaggregated by program major	9
Table 5. Types of school (school levels) in which Touro School Leadership completers first served as teachers disaggregated by program major	10
Table 6. Teaching licenses under which Touro Leadership completers were employed prior to completing the Leadership program disaggregated by program major	11
Table 7. Employment status of Touro Leadership program completers after program completion disaggregated by program major (Classes of 2016, 2017, & 2018) (Status as of Dec. 31, 2018)	12
Table 8. School Leadership Positions Obtained by Touro Scholl Leadership Program completers by Program Major (Classes of 2016, 2017, & 2018)	13

Overview and Purpose of the Study

There is a critical need for educator preparation institutions to collect and use data to assess the efficacy of their programs and inform program improvement efforts. This need was underscored in a speech by former Education Secretary Arne Duncan at Teachers' College in October 2009. Duncan asserted, "The bottom line is that we lack empirical evidence of what works in preparing teachers for an outcome-based education system. We don't know what, where, how, or when teacher education is most effective."

Duncan's admonition concerning educator preparation programs includes school leadership preparation. The importance of data-based inquiry to the design and re-design of all educator preparation is embodied in "the culture of evidence and data for educator preparation" that underlies the CAEP Standards. Version 2.0 of the CAEP Evidence Guide (2015) cites the following definition of the 'culture of evidence' used by the regional accreditor, Western Association of Schools and Colleges: A habit of using evidence in assessment, decision making, planning, resource allocation, and other institutional processes that is embodied in the characteristics of an institution's actions and processes.¹

CAEP Standard 5 requires that the Education Program Provider maintains a quality assurance system comprised of valid data from multiple measures, including evidence of candidates' and completers' positive impact on P-12 student learning and development. Among the sources of evidence required for the quality assurance system are data on licensing, graduation, and hiring rates.

As part of its efforts to support data-based inquiry and decision-making and meet the CAEP standards for accreditation, the Dean's Office of the Touro College Graduate School of Education is conducting an ongoing study that tracks longitudinally the graduates of its educator preparation programs. With respect to School Leadership, the objectives of this research are to assess the success of completers of Touro's School Leadership programs in moving into school and district supervisory and administrative positions from classroom teaching positions and outside the profession, and, over the longer term, to determine their effectiveness and longevity in their new positions. The results of this research are intended to be used for several purposes. First, to help faculty and administrators evaluate the success of Touro's School Leadership preparation programs in developing high quality school and district administrators who are prepared to serve in inner-city schools. Second, to identify the characteristics and sources of participants in Touro's School Leadership program to help inform ongoing efforts to improve recruitment into the program. And third, to use the data to bolster Touro's evidence base in support of continuing accreditation of its School Leadership program.

This research focuses on the employment of Touro School Leadership completers in the New York City Department of Education's (NYCDOE) schools. Studying the relationship

¹ The Western Association of Schools and Colleges. (2013). *2013 Handbook of Accreditation* (p. 47). Retrieved from <http://www.wascsenior.org/resources/handbook-accreditation-2013>

between Touro and the NYCDOE is important for two reasons. First, NYCDOE is both a major source of applicants to and the largest employer of completers from Touro's educator preparation programs. Second, NYCDOE maintains an extensive and reliable human resources database that stores historical data on all educator personnel employed in the public schools that can be linked to descriptive data on the schools, as well as data in Touro's student database. Linking data from these databases can be used to track completers' interactions between Touro and the NYCDOE.

This is the third free-standing report on the School Leadership program-completer tracking research. The first two reports focused on completers from the Classes of 2016 and 2017, separately. Key findings from the reports were as follows:

- Prior to completing the School Leadership program, more than 70% of the completers from both classes were employed as teachers in NYC public schools (NYCPS). Teaching experience is a pre-requisite for acceptance into the program and most of the program completers were getting that experience in the NYCPS at the time of their program enrollment and completion.
- Overall, one-fifth of the completers for both classes who had been teaching in NYCPS obtained positions as supervisors or administrators, the principal goal of the School Leadership program. Most (over 70%) of the new administrators obtained positions as assistant principals.
- Around 65% of the completers continued to teach following program completion. It was expected that many of these completers who continued to teach in the NYCPS would apply for and obtain administrator/supervisor positions in the future.

The current report focuses on the results of the graduate tracking study for the Class of 2018, students who completed their School Leadership program in the 2017 – 2018 academic year. It also provides an update on the progress of the Classes of 2016 and 2017, one and two years, respectively, following their program completion.

Audience

The primary intended audience for this research is the School Leadership program faculty and administrators at Touro's Graduate School of Education. This audience can use the data to assess how well these programs are preparing participants for successful promotion to school leadership positions in the NYCPS. The data can inform discussions at many venues concerning ways to improve the effectiveness of the programs. Another audience is the program reviewers and auditors at CAEP, who will use these data to help make decisions about continuing accreditation for Touro. In addition, the results will be shared with officials at the NYCDOE, especially the Division of Human Resources. The results can also be incorporated into presentations at national conferences on educational research.

Research Questions (RQ)

The study uses a non-experimental, quantitative research design with extant data to address research questions about the descriptive characteristics of Touro School Leadership program completers, their employment in the NYCDOE prior to program completion, and the change in their employment status following program completion. The research questions addressed in this report are as follows:

- **RQ 1:** What were the descriptive characteristics of the completers of the Touro School Leadership program for the Classes of 2016, 2017, and 2018?
- **RQ 2:** How many completers of the School Leadership program were employed in the NYCPS prior to program completion? What were their positions and in which types of schools were they employed?
- **RQ 3:** How did completing the Touro School Leadership program affect the graduates' NYCPS employment status? How many completers moved into administrative/supervisory positions upon or after graduation? How many continued to be employed in the NYCPS?

Methodology

Participants

The participants are students who completed Touro's School Leadership program in the academic years 2015-16, 2016-17, and 2017-18. The Dean's Office at Touro's School of Education compiled a list of all program completers, including their names, dates of graduation, major license area, social security numbers (last five digits), and birth dates. After eliminating cases with missing information and duplicates, the file of program completers had 189 cases, distributed by class as follows:

Class of 2016 = 53 completers

Class of 2017 = 71 completers

Class of 2018 = 65 completers

Data

The data for the study were employee data extracted from the NYCDOE Employee Information System (EIS) and descriptive data on the program completers extracted from the Touro student information system. The EIS data included the following data elements:

- Data on the first assignment of program completers hired in NYCPS, including initial license, position, school name and type (level), and effective date;
- Data on their most recent assignment, including school building or district name and type of school, position, license, and effective date; and
- Their current employment status as of December 31, 2018, including active status (Regular Teacher, Administrator/Supervisor, On Leave, or Terminated), current location and type of school, job title, and number of years of active service.

Data Analysis

The analytic file used to address the RQs was built through a series of match/merge routines. First, the Touro Dean's Office sent the Excel file of Touro graduates' social security numbers and birth dates (File 1) to NYCDOE over a secure data transfer site (FileZilla) for matching and merging to the EIS file. Then, NYCDOE transferred the matched/merged file (File 2) back to the Dean's Office. Next, the Dean's Office ran a merge of File 2 to the original Touro graduate file to pick up data on year of graduation, program, and campus location, thereby creating File 3, the final analytic file. All merges and data analyses were performed with SPSS, version 24.0 software. The data analysis procedures used to address the research questions used descriptive statistics, including frequency distributions and cross-tabulations.

Results

RQ 1: Description of the School Leadership Completers

This section describes the participants in the study sample in terms of age and program major. All participants attended the Manhattan campus, the home location of the School Leadership program. Table 1 shows the age of the study sample as of their date of program completion. The data are categorized into intervals ranging from 30 or Under through Greater Than 50 years of age. The age intervals with the largest percentages of completers were 31 – 35 and 36 – 40. Around 27% of completers in the three classes combined were in each of these two intervals. The age distributions varied somewhat among the three classes of completers. About one-third of the Class of 2016 were 31-35, while the same percentage of the Class of 2017 were 36-40. A smaller percentage of the Class of 2018 (12.3%) were 30 or Under than the Class of 2016 (18.9%) or the Class of 2017 (21.1%). The median ages were 35 for the Class of 2016 and 37 for the Classes of 2017 and 2018.

Table 1. Age distribution of Touro School Leadership program completers by year of completion

Age Interval	Statistic	Completion year			Total
		2016	2017	2018	
< or = 30	N completers	10	15	8	33
	% within year	18.9%	21.1%	12.3%	17.5%
31 - 35	N completers	18	15	17	50
	% within year	34.0%	21.1%	26.2%	26.5%
36 - 40	N completers	12	24	15	51
	% within year	22.6%	33.8%	23.1%	27.0%
41 - 45	N completers	9	11	14	34
	% within year	17.0%	15.5%	21.5%	18.0%
46 - 50	N completers	2	4	6	12
	% within year	3.8%	5.6%	9.2%	6.3%
> 50	N completers	2	2	5	9
	% within year	3.8%	2.8%	7.7%	4.8%
Total	N completers	53	71	65	189
	% within year	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

Table 2 displays the program major in which each class of completers specialized. The only program major offered in 2016 was titled School Leadership, with 53 completers. Most (127 or at least 93% of each class) of the completers for 2017 and 2018 were enrolled in the dual license area, School Building and District Leadership. The remaining nine for these classes were enrolled in the single license major of School Building Leadership.

Table 2. Program majors of Touro School Leadership program completers by year of program completion

Program major	Statistic	Completion year			Total
		2016	2017	2018	
Dual School Building & District Leadership	N completers	0	66	61	127
	% within year	0.0%	93.0%	93.8%	67.2%
School Building Leadership	N completers	0	5	4	9
	% within year	0.0%	7.0%	6.2%	4.8%
School Leadership	N completers	53	0	0	53
	% within year	100.0%	0.0%	0.0%	28.0%
Total	N completers	53	71	65	189
	% within year	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

RQ 2. Employment of Touro School Leadership Completers in NYCPS Prior to Program Completion

Prior to completing the School Leadership program, 131 (69.3%) of the 189 completers for the three classes were employed as teachers in NYCPS. Teaching experience is a pre-requisite for acceptance into the program and most of the program completers were getting that experience in the NYC public schools at the time of their program enrollment and completion. The remainder were most likely teaching in non-public schools or outside of the city. As displayed in Table 2 above, the descriptive variables Completion Year and Program Major are confounded. That is, all of the completers for 2016 were in the program major labeled School Leadership, while most of the completers for 2017 and 2018 were in Dual School Building and District Leadership. Therefore, except for Table 3, rather than disaggregating the data by completion year, the data below, addressing Research Questions 2 and 3, will be disaggregated by program major.

Table 3 displays the numbers and percentages of completers in each program that were employed in the NYC public schools prior to program completion. These data are not only descriptive, but also provide a baseline for measuring the impact of the School Leadership program on the promotion of completers to school leadership positions. For the total sample of 189 completers, those who finished the School Leadership program in 2016 had the highest percentage employed as teachers prior to program completion, 84.9%, or 45 of 53 completers. For the dual major, School Building & District Leadership, 82 of the 127 (64.6%) were employed as teachers prior to program completion, as were four (44.4%) of the nine from School

Building Leadership. Data not displayed in Table 3, show that nearly all (128 out of 131) of the completers were experienced, having been hired as teachers more than two years prior to program completion.

Table 3. Number and percentage of Touro Leadership Program completers in each program major that were employed as teachers in the NYC Public Schools prior to program completion by year of completion

Year of Completion	Statistic	Program major			Total
		Dual School Building & District Leadership	School Building Leadership	School Leadership	
2016	N Completers	0	0	53	53
	N Employed	0	0	45	45
	% Employed	NA	NA	84.9%	84.9%
2017	N Completers	66	5	0	71
	N Employed	45	3	0	48
	% Employed	68.2%	60.0%	NA	67.6%
2018	N Completers	61	4	0	65
	N Employed	37	1	0	38
	% Employed	60.7%	25.0%	NA	58.5%
Total	N Completers	127	9	53	189
	N Employed	82	4	45	131
	% Employed	64.6%	44.4%	84.9%	69.3%

Table 4. Boroughs in which completers of Touro School Leadership program were first hired as teachers disaggregated by program major

Borough	Statistic	Program major			Total
		Dual School Building & District Leadership	School Building Leadership	School Leadership	
Manhattan	N Completers	11	0	8	19
	% within major	13.6%	0.0%	17.8%	14.6%
Bronx	N Completers	10	1	1	12
	% within major	12.3%	25.0%	2.2%	9.2%
Brooklyn	N Completers	33	2	20	55
	% within major	40.7%	50.0%	44.4%	42.3%
Queens	N Completers	20	1	10	31
	% within major	24.7%	25.0%	22.2%	23.8%
Staten Island	N Completers	7	0	6	13
	% within major	8.6%	0.0%	13.3%	10.0%
	N Completers	81	4	45	130
	% within major	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

Note. Data missing for one hired program completer

Tables 4 – 6 provide a descriptive portrait of the schools in which the completers were first hired as teachers prior to program completion and the positions they held. Table 4 displays the borough distribution of their first schools of employment. For the three classes combined, Brooklyn schools hired a plurality of the completers, 42.3%, followed by Queens schools with 23.8%. The percentages who were serving in Manhattan and Staten Island schools have declined compared to the 13.3% of School Leadership program completers in 2016.

As can be seen in Table 5, which shows the types or levels of schools in which School Leadership completers were employed as teachers, 38.5% were employed in elementary schools, 18.5% in high schools, and 13% - 15% in middle schools and K-8 schools, respectively.

Table 5. Types of schools (school levels) in which Touro School Leadership completers first served as teachers disaggregated by program major

Type of School	Statistic	Program Major			Total
		School Building & District Leadership	School Building Leadership	School Leadership	
DISTRICT/REGIONAL OFFICE	N Completers	0	0	2	2
	% within major	0.0%	0.0%	2.2%	1.5%
DISTRICT PRE-K CENTER	N Completers	2	0	0	2
	% within major	2.4%	0.0%	0.0%	1.5%
EARLY CHILDHOOD	N Completers	1	0	0	1
	% within major	1.2%	0.0%	0.0%	0.8%
ELEMENTARY	N Completers	34	1	15	50
	% within major	41.5%	25.0%	33.3%	38.5%
HIGH SCHOOL	N Completers	18	0	6	24
	% within major	22.0%	0.0%	13.3%	18.5%
JUNIOR HIGH-INTERMEDIATE-MIDDLE	N Completers	9	0	8	17
	% within major	11.0%	0.0%	17.8%	13.1%
K-12 ALL GRADES	N Completers	4	0	3	7
	% within major	4.9%	0.0%	6.7%	5.4%
K-8	N Completers	9	3	7	19
	% within major	11.0%	75.0%	15.6%	14.6%
SECONDARY SCHOOL	N Completers	4	0	4	8
	% within major	4.9%	0.0%	8.9%	6.2%
Total	N Completers	81	4	45	130
	% within major	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

Note. Data missing for one hired program completer

Table 6 displays the license descriptions of the first teaching jobs of the completers who were teaching in NYCPS. The license descriptions of the largest numbers of completers were special education (32.8%) and common branches (25.2%). Small numbers served under a wide variety of licenses, chief among which were Social Studies (6.9%), Speech Improvement (6.1%), and English and mathematics, with 5.3% each. Three out of the four School Building Leadership completers were Special Education teachers.

Table 6. Teaching licenses under which Touro Leadership completers were employed prior to completing the Leadership program disaggregated by program major

Teaching license prior to completion of Leadership program	Statistic	Program Major			Total
		Dual School Building & District Leadership	School Building Leadership	School Leadership	
Special Education	N Completers	26	3	14	43
	% Within Major	31.7%	75.0%	31.1%	32.8%
Common Branches	N Completers	22	1	10	33
	% Within Major	26.8%	25.0%	22.2%	25.2%
Social Studies	N Completers	4	0	5	9
	% Within Major	4.9%	0.0%	11.1%	6.9%
Speech Improvement	N Completers	3	0	5	8
	% Within Major	3.7%	0.0%	11.1%	6.1%
English	N Completers	5	0	2	7
	% Within Major	6.1%	0.0%	4.4%	5.3%
Mathematics	N Completers	5	0	2	7
	% Within Major	6.1%	0.0%	4.4%	5.3%
Early Childhood Classes	N Completers	4	0	2	6
	% Within Major	4.9%	0.0%	4.4%	4.6%
English As A Second Language	N Completers	3	0	1	4
	% Within Major	3.7%	0.0%	2.2%	3.1%
Other	N Completers	10	0	4	14
	% Within Major	12.2%	0.0%	8.9%	10.7%
Total	N Completers	82	4	45	131
	% Within Major	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

RQ 3. Change in NYCPS Employment Status of School Leadership Graduates on/after Program Completion

Table 7 displays the employment status of the 131 program completers who were employed in the NYCPS as of Dec. 31, 2018, after they had completed the School Leadership program. The data are disaggregated by program major. For the three program majors combined, 28 (21.4%) of the 131 completers who had been teaching, obtained school leadership positions in the NYCPS following Touro Leadership program completion. A total of 84

continued to teach in the NYCPS, 41 (31.3%) as Regular Teachers and 43 (32.8%) as Special Education Teachers. The School Leadership major had the highest percentage of completers (24.4%) obtaining school leadership positions of the three majors. Having completed the program in 2016, they also had the longest opportunity to engage in the lengthy process of searching, applying, and interviewing for a leadership position by the time of data collection. Completers from the Classes of 2017 and 2018, who comprised nearly all of the Dual School Building and District Leadership completers, had much less time to engage in the leadership job-finding process.

Table 7. Employment status of Touro Leadership program completers after program completion disaggregated by program major (Classes of 2016, 2017, & 2018) (Status as of Dec. 31, 2018)

Post-Program Completion Position Status	Statistic	Program Major			Total
		Dual School Building & District Leadership	School Building Leadership	School Leadership	
School Leadership Position *	N Hired Completers	17	0	11	28
	% within major	20.7%	0.0%	24.4%	21.4%
Teacher	N Hired Completers	28	0	13	41
	% within major	34.1%	0.0%	28.9%	31.3%
Teacher-Special Education	N Hired Completers	26	3	14	43
	% within major	31.7%	75.0%	31.1%	32.8%
Terminated	N Hired Completers	11	1	7	19
	% within major	13.4%	25.0%	15.6%	14.5%
Total	N Hired Completers	82	4	45	131
	% within major	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

** Includes 5 Teachers Assigned A who served in administrative/supervisory roles.

Table 8 displays the specific types of positions of the 28 program completers who obtained school leadership positions. The largest number, 12, obtained positions as Assistant Principals. An additional six were employed as 12-month Assistant Principals, three in regular schools and three in special education schools, for a grand total of 18 Assistant Principals. Four other completers were employed as Teachers Assigned A, positions that involve supervisory and administrative responsibilities.

The number of School Leadership program completers obtaining school leadership positions is a good beginning for the Classes of 2016 - 2018. The application and interview process for obtaining these positions is complex and time-consuming and the numbers will rise over time. It is expected that many of the completers who continue to teach will apply for, and obtain, administrator/supervisor positions in the coming years.

Table 8. School Leadership Positions Obtained by Touro School Leadership Program Completers by Program Major (Classes of 2016, 2017, & 2018)

Post-Program-Completion School Leadership Positions	Program Major			Total
	Dual School Building & District Leadership	School Building Leadership	School Leadership	
12 MONTH ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL	3	0	0	3
12 MONTH SPECIAL ED ASST PRINCIPAL	2	0	1	3
ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL	6	0	6	12
EDUCATIONAL ADMINISTRATOR CSA	1	0	0	1
SUPERVISOR	1	0	3	4
TEACHER ASSIGNED A	4	0	1	5
TOTAL SCHOOL LEADERSHIP POSITIONS	17	0	11	28

Summary and Conclusions

This is the third free-standing report of findings from an ongoing study that tracks the employment and retention of Touro School Leadership program completers that work in the New York City public schools (NYCPS). The study uses a non-experimental, quantitative research design with extant data to address the principal research questions about the numbers, percentages, and characteristics of program completers who advance from teaching to school leadership positions in the NYCPS, as well as the program's impact on their retention in the school system. This report focused on completers of the School Leadership program from 2017-18 (the Class of 2018), as well as updates on the progress of the Classes of 2016 and 2017. The data for the study were employee data extracted from the NYCDOE Employee Information System (EIS). The major findings and conclusions are as follows:

- **Descriptively, the age intervals with the largest numbers of completers were 31 - 35 and 36 - 40, each with around 27% of the completers in the three classes combined.** The median ages were 35 for the Class of 2016 and 37 for the Classes of 2017 and 2018.
- **Most (127 or 93%) of the completers for 2017 and 2018 were enrolled in the dual license area, School Building and District Leadership. The remaining nine for these classes were enrolled in the single license major of School Building Leadership. The only program major offered in 2016 was titled School Leadership, with 53 completers.**
- **Prior to completing the School Leadership program, 131 (69.3%) of the 189 completers for the three classes combined were employed as teachers in NYCPS.** Teaching experience is a pre-requisite for acceptance into the program and most of the program completers were getting that experience in the NYC public schools at the time of their program enrollment and completion. The remainder were most likely teaching in non-public schools or outside of the city.

- **For the total of 131 completers employed as teachers prior to program completion, more than two-fifths (42.3%) were working in Brooklyn and 23.8% in Queens schools. Also, nearly one in five (38.5%) were employed in elementary schools, 18.5% in high schools, and 13 and 15% in middle schools and K-8 schools, respectively. The license descriptions of the largest numbers of completers were special education (33.8%) followed by common branches (25.2%).**
- **Twenty-eight (21.4%) of the 131 completers who had been teaching, obtained school leadership positions in the NYCPS following Touro Leadership program completion, the principal long-term goal of the program. Of the 28, 18 obtained jobs as Assistant Principals.** A total of 84 continued to teach in the NYCPS, 41 (31.3%) as Regular Teachers and 43 (32.8%) as Special Education Teachers. The School Leadership program major had the highest percentage of completers (24.4%) obtaining school leadership positions of the three majors. Having completed the program in 2016, they also had the longest opportunity to engage in the lengthy process of searching, applying, and interviewing for a leadership position by the time of data collection. Completers from the Classes of 2017 and 2018, who were nearly enrolled in the Dual School Building and District Leadership program, had much less time to engage in the leadership job-finding process.

The number of Touro School Leadership program completers obtaining supervisory/administrative jobs in the NYCPS observed in this report is a good beginning for the Class of 2018 and a continuation of the good results shown by the Classes of 2016 and 2017 in previous reports of this research. The application and interview process for obtaining these positions is complex and time-consuming and the numbers will rise over time. It is expected that many of the completers who continue to teach will apply for and obtain administrator/supervisor positions in the coming years, thereby continuing to manifest the impact of Touro's School Leadership program on the preparation of a pool of educators prepared for assuming leadership roles in the NYCPS.